

CORRESPONDENCE

easily achieved if a fluid that is more normal than "normal" saline becomes commercially available.

Pema Dorje, M.D.

Assistant Professor

pemdor@umich.edu

Gaury Adhikary, M.D.

Assistant Professor

Department of Anesthesiology

University of Michigan Medical Center

Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-0048

Deepak K. Tempe, M.D.

Professor of Anaesthesiology

G. B. Pant Hospital

New Delhi, India

Anesthesiology

2000; 92:626

© 2000 American Society of Anesthesiologists, Inc.

Lippincott Williams & Wilkins, Inc.

In Reply:—We are grateful to have the opportunity to respond to the thoughtful comments by Drs. Story *et al.*, Drummond, and Dorje *et al.* We entirely agree with Story *et al.* that the Stewart approach¹ provides a fundamental insight into acid-base equilibrium, and that in many cases this approach better explains the causes for metabolic pH changes than the Henderson-Hasselbalch² approach. Nevertheless, the Henderson-Hasselbalch equation is still correct, and most clinicians work well with this equation, despite the fact that the equation does not reflect the whole background of acid-base homeostasis. Consequently, it seemed appropriate to present a well-balanced discussion of our results in the light of the "traditional" Henderson-Hasselbalch approach and the "modern" Stewart approach.

We respond to the letter by Dr. Drummond by stating that we did not claim to be the first to evaluate acid-base changes under large saline infusions. However, probably because of unfortunately chosen key words, we did not come across the report by McFarlane and Lee while preparing our manuscript.³

The question asked by Dorje *et al.* whether artificial hyperchloremia has any important adverse effects cannot be answered with our data. Perioperative hyperchloremia seems to be benign in patients with normal renal function; however, we agree that for critically ill patients, especially those with acute or chronic renal failure, more "physiologic" crystalloid solutions would be advantageous. The proposal of Dorje *et al.* ($\text{Na}^+ = 140$ mm, $\text{Cl}^- = 100$ mm, and lactate or bicarbonate = 40 mm) would probably lead to an ongoing metabolic alkalosis in case of 40 mm bicarbonate content. Our experience with substitutes containing lactate suggests that these solutions will cause a slight but continuous increase in serum lactate

Anesthesiology

2000; 92:626-7

© 2000 American Society of Anesthesiologists, Inc.

Lippincott Williams & Wilkins, Inc.

In Reply:—We appreciate the comments of Drummond¹ and Story *et al.*² Both letters address issues that clarify the report by Scheingraber *et al.*³

First, Drummond¹ appropriately calls additional attention to the

References

1. Scheingraber S, Rehm M, Sehmisch C, Finsterer U: Rapid Saline Infusion Produces Hyperchloremic Acidosis in Patients Undergoing Gynecologic Procedures. *ANESTHESIOLOGY* 1999; 90:1265-70
2. Wilcox CS: Regulation of renal blood flow by plasma chloride. *J Clin Invest* 1983; 71:726-35
3. Wilcox CS: Release of renin and angiotensin II into plasma and lymph during hyperchloremia. *Am J Physiol* 1987; 253:F734-41
4. Mathes DD, Morel RC, Rohr MS: Dilutional Acidosis: Is it a real clinical entity? *ANESTHESIOLOGY* 1997; 86:501-3

(Accepted for publication September 23, 1999.)

concentration. Unfortunately, this artificial increase in serum lactate concentration will lead to loss of an essential routine monitoring for inadequate tissue oxygenation. In summary, we conclude that the ideal electrolyte composition of crystalloids has not yet been found, and further investigations in this field are necessary.

Udilo Finsterer, M.D.

Professor of Anesthesiology

jfreeden@ana.med.uni-muenchen.de

Stefan Scheingraber, M.D.

Staff Anesthesiologist

Markus Rehm, M.D.

Staff Anesthesiologist

Clinic of Anesthesiology

Ludwig-Maximilians University

Marchionistr 15

Munich D-81377, Germany

References

1. Stewart PA: Modern quantitative acid-base chemistry. *Can J Physiol Pharmacol* 1983; 61:1444-61
2. Sigaard-Andersen O: The Acid-Base Status of the Blood. 4th Edition. Baltimore: Williams and Wilkins, 1976
3. McFarlane C, Lee A: A comparison of plasmalyte 148 and 0.9% saline for intraoperative fluid replacement. *Anaesthesia* 1994; 49:779-81

(Accepted for publication September 23, 1999.)

important study by his colleagues at the Royal Infirmary in Edinburgh.⁴ Both McFarlane and Lee⁴ and Scheingraber *et al.*³ conducted randomized clinical trials comparing 0.9% saline balanced salt solutions. The two studies differ in that McFarlane and Lee⁴ enrolled patients under-